Library Services Data:
Assessing Impact on Student Success in a Data-Informed College

Presented by Bob Holzmann, M.B.A., Systems & Digital Technologies Librarian

November 9, 2018
Oklahoma Association of College and Research Libraries
Library Services Data:
Assessing Impact on Student Success

Team members:
Adam Brennan, Amanda Ross, Josh Barnes, Bob Holzmann (leader), Stephanie Ingold (library management liaison), Paula Settoon (Dean)
The Library Services Assessment Plan

- Executive Summary
- Background Details
- 7 parts: Methods & Data Info
- Conclusion
- Bibliography
Library Services Assessment Plan

• Library Services Impact Upon Student Success: Method and Data

• Recommendations

• Implementation
Background: “In the Beginning”

- No Existing Formal Library Assessment Plan
- Assessment? What is Library Assessment?
- Reasons to assess library services?
- Why Count, Measure, and Report?
Our Strategic Plan: Goals, Objectives

• College and Library Strategic Plans Goals & Objectives

• TCC Goal: Performance Based Culture

• TCC Objective: Institutional Effectiveness Plan

• Library Objective: Create a formal services evaluation plan

• Library Objective: Tie data to operations, activities, programs, etc.
Data: Why We Count, Measure, Report

- A “Data-informed” Organization
- Evidence-based Performance, Evaluation
- Qualitative versus (or plus) Quantitative
- Justify, Improve, Add Library Services
- Workload measures: Staffing, Hours, Output
- Bragging Rights!
Routine Data / Library Annual Report

- Library Computer Lab: use by log-ins
- Print and online: usage & holdings
- College-wide Totals: not by campus
- Technical Services: workload output
- Provide counters: all library entrances
Acquire & Use Data: Focus Groups

- Qualitative assessment method: Hard & Soft Data
- Couple with customer service mapping technique
- Limit number of issues, participants
- Explore specific areas of satisfaction/dissatisfaction
- Combine: library surveys with focus groups
- Collect Data: Analyze, Interpret, Report, Decide
Acquire & Use Data: Surveys

- Qualitative or quantitative methods
- TCC’s college-wide surveys
- Conduct: limited library-only surveys
- Create: Internal library survey instrument
- Combine: library surveys with focus groups
- Collect Data: Analyze, Interpret, Report, Decide
Acquire & Use Data: E-Resources Stats

- Bi-annual Usage Reports revised
- Online Articles, E-Books, E-Videos, E-Reference
- Usage/Cost Data for analysis, selection, planning
- Cost Analysis: Print vs. E-Resources
- Usage, Holdings data for IPEDS and ACRL
- Access data logs: Statistical impact on student success
Collection Assessment

• Custom Reports to Evaluate Collections
• Interlibrary Loan (ILL) requests analysis
• Missing and Lost items

• Electronic Resources versus Print
• Online Resources for New Academic Programs
• Open Access Collections and OER
Other Departments’ Services within the Library

• Services in the library provided by other departments

• Effect students' use and perception of the library

• Future assessment of such services
The Top Measure: Student Success

• Academic Achievement: GPA

• Persistence: 3 years to completion

• Completion = Graduation or Transfer

• Degree and Certificate Programs

So, what impact do library services have upon student success?
Library Services Impact on Student Success

• Historically, assessment of library effect on academic success was impossible to measure and quantify

• How to achieve quantitative evaluation using hard data and make the connection?

• Recent published studies about statistical methods to correlate library use and student success

• Embark on a journey into new assessment territory that few others (and no community colleges) have explored
Library Services Impact on Student Success

• Soria, Fransen, and Nackerund’s & other studies demonstrating library impact on student success

• Methods for obtaining our data are in place

• Investigate possible correlation and impact:
  • Multivariate statistical analyses
  • Longitudinal studies
  • Creative improvements to methodology
  • Longer-term predictive studies
Library Services Impact on Student Success

• Approval from TCC’s Institutional Review Board (IRB)

• Strengthening TCC Partnerships:
  1. Institutional Research & Assessment (IR&A)
  2. Information Technology Infrastructure Services (ITIS)
  3. Academic Departments & College Leadership

• Statistical methods couple Library users’ data with student information, academic data, other services

• Balanced mix of quantitative and qualitative
Data: Impact on Student Success

• Points of Service (POS): Contact via systems or staff

• Library academic services that impact student success

• Data Points defined for library services

• Systems Enhancements and Planning
Data: Services for Student Success

- Computers Use
- Reserves
- Circulation
- Electronic Resources
- Interlibrary Loan
- Study Rooms
- Reference Desk

NEW

Not collecting
Data: Services for Student Success

Library Computers Used

- Successful Logins
- Computer Hostname
- Grouped by Campus Library
- Provided each Semester
- I.T. gets files from archived logs
Data: Services for Student Success

Circulating Collections

- Check-outs and Renewals
- Worldshare Mgmt System
- WMS Reports/Analytics
- Provided from WMS database
Data: Services for Student Success

Course Reserves Use

- Check-outs and Renewals
- Worldshare Mgmt System
- WMS Reports/Analytics
- Reported by Semester
Data: Services for Student Success

Interlibrary Loan

- OCLC Tipasa ILL
- Data Export to Excel
- Borrowing: Closed, Supplied
- Enhancement Summer 2018
- Reports last 400 transactions
Data: Services for Student Success

Electronic Resources Use

- EZproxy Custom SPU logging
- SPU log rolls-over monthly
- ALL Authentication Required
- Subscription e-Resources
- SPU logs copied, converted
Data: Services for Student Success

Study Rooms Use

- Think Tanks, Library Classrooms
- All students TCC IDs in a group
- Springshare LibApps
- TCC ID required field added
- LibWizard Survey Report export
Data: Services for Student Success

- Library Instruction
- Research Consultations
- Collaborative Spaces
- Mobile Texting
- Online Chat and Email
- Faculty Consultations
- Librarian Liaison

Enhancement Request
Not Planned
NEW
PLANNED
Data: Services for Student Success

Library Instruction

- Librarian as the Instructor
- Library Instruction in any classroom
- Faculty, Course Number, Section
- TCC ID in data for Course & Section
- Librarians enter data in LibInsight
- LibInsights database export

Library Instruction

- Research Consultations
- Online Chat and Email
- Faculty Consultations
- Collaborative Spaces
- Mobile texting
- Librarian Liaison

January, 2018
Data: Services for Student Success

**Research Consultations**

- Librarian provides direct service
- Appointment or “walk in”
- TCC ID may be entered by Librarian
- Librarians enter data in LibInsight
- LibInsights Database Export
Data: Services for Student Success

Online Chat and Email
- Chat form has TCC ID field
- LibAnswers stats transcripts export
- Email questions, our AskUs Service
- Email form includes the TCC ID
- LibAnswers stats tickets export
Data: Services for Student Success

Faculty Consultations

- Librarian as liaison by subject
- Appointment or on the spot
- Data entered by Librarian
- LibWizard Form, Report export
- How does this impact student success?
TCC standard statistics parameters and definitions

• Demographics: ethnicity, first generation, socio-economic, etc.

• Time divisions: Semester, Time of Day, Academic Year, etc.

• Cohort - fall semester entering Freshmen, 3 years duration

• Student criteria, definitions: full time, declared major, etc.

• Criteria required to measure Student Success

Data Analysis: Impact on Student Success
Data: Universal Primary Elements

• Specific library service or program

• Student ID number (TCC ID)

• Date (Year Month Day)

• Hour (00 – 23)
Data: Important Additional Elements

- Minute (00 – 59) start of activity or point of service
- Related types of service activities or functions
- Originating IP address if using a computer
- Other elements TBD as the study is fine tuned
Perfect, or Not So Perfect ... How perfect is perfect enough?

Criteria for selecting, preparing data: Limiters, Scope, Redundancy

Normalize and Trim the data

Student library services use levels (no use, low, medium, high)

What don’t we know? Assumptions?
Data: Collect, Protect, Select, Aggregate
Data: Collect, Protect, Select, Aggregate
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>H</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>J</th>
<th>K</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>192.173.60.168</td>
<td>T9898989898</td>
<td>14-Feb-18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Morning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>198.90.26.74</td>
<td>T1212121212</td>
<td>15-Feb-18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Afternoon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data: Collect, Protect, Select, Aggregate

LogSPU spu.log \%{\%Y/\%m/\%d}t\t\%{\%H}t\t\%{\%M}t\t\%h\t\%u\t\%v

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>99.50.47.159</td>
<td>T123454321 search.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454322 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>68.13.229.106</td>
<td>T123454323 web.a.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454324 search.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454325 link.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454326 go.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>70.185.254.56</td>
<td>T123454328 web.b.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454329 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454334 find.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454335 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454336 find.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454337 find.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>166.177.121.110</td>
<td>T123454338 infotrac.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454339 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>70.185.254.212</td>
<td>T123454343 ic.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454344 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454346 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After ‘Remove Duplicates’ on A, B, E

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>99.50.47.159</td>
<td>T123454321 search.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>10.4.140.27</td>
<td>T123454322 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454326 go.galegroup.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2018</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>76.201.102.171</td>
<td>T123454346 openurl.ebscohost.com</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Analysis: Impact on Student Success

• Regression: linear, multiple, stepwise, ordinal

• Multivariate and multicollinearity testing

• Regression Analysis – establish the correlation

• Factor Analysis – find what is most correlated to outcome variables

• A control group? Maybe not ...
Data: Future Assessment Considerations

- Recently Underway: Librarian Liaison Project Team
- Recently Underway: Learning Assessment Project
- Future: Applying study results
- Future: Predictive Studies and Analysis
- Applied Assessment: Program Review! **IMPORTANT**
Selected Bibliography

Library Services Data:
Assessing Impact on Student Success

fin
Library Services Assessment:
Thank you for participating today!

On Behalf of Our Team:
Adam Brennan, Amanda Ross, Josh Barnes, Bob Holzmann (leader),
and Stephanie Ingold (library management liaison)
Assessment: Doing Things Better

"... now, let’s see how we can do this better ..."  (Dr. Leigh Goodson, TCC President)

Assessment = **Strategic Goals**

Assessment = **Compliance**

Assessment = **Cause and Effect**

Assessment = **Performance**

Assessment = **Improvement**